



## Examiner Tip Sheet | Independent Review

### Welcome to Independent Review!

The purpose of Independent Review is for each team member to independently evaluate the applicant's processes and results by identifying areas of strength and opportunities for improvement (OFIs) relative to the Baldrige Excellence Framework. The following pages contain helpful tips and step-by-step instructions for completing your Independent Review.

Many examiners have found this stage of the evaluation process to be both challenging and valuable. As you immerse yourself in gathering evidence and suggesting insights to help your applicant organization improve, your own personal learning on how to apply the Baldrige framework will add tremendous value to your organization and enhance your personal effectiveness in your own role.

### *A few things to remember before you begin...*

1. Start early! Set a schedule that works for you and stick to it. **Finish your Independent Review at least two weeks prior to the consensus meeting** to allow time for category leaders to synthesize.
2. If you are assigned to a Level 2, 3 or 4 team, you will access your scorebook via the Scorebook Navigator software. If you are assigned to a Level 1 team, the Level 1 scorebook can be found on the [Examiner Resources](#) page of TNCPE's website.
3. Your goal is to help the applicant take the next step. Focus on what is important to them.
4. Your teammates are going to rely on your Independent Review work. Make sure it is as clear and concise as possible (make note of page numbers, figure numbers, etc. for quick reference).
5. Information is not always in the designated area; you may need to pull from other sections of the application. Keep in mind that you will evaluate all 17 items of the application.
6. Remember: We are evaluating the applicant only against the Baldrige Excellence Framework.
7. Be sure to refer to the resources that are available on the [Examiner Resources](#) page of TNCPE's website. An index of resource pages is available in the back of your training notebook.
8. If you have trouble downloading documents from [Examiner Resources](#), try updating your web browser (e.g. Internet Explorer, Mozilla, Firefox, etc.) or contact [TNCPE](#) for additional assistance.
9. You can **always** contact TNCPE for help at (800) 453-6474 or [contact@tncpe.org](mailto:contact@tncpe.org).

***Trust the Process!***

Steps	Actions
<p><b>Logging on to the software</b></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Access Scorebook Navigator at <a href="https://scorebooknav.org">https://scorebooknav.org</a>.</li> <li>• You will use the same username and password you selected for pre-work.</li> <li>• If you forget your password, select “Forgot Password?” on the Scorebook Navigator log-in screen. You will be directed to enter your username (<b>firstnamelastname</b>). Then your password will be sent to the email address on file.</li> </ul> <p style="border: 1px dashed black; padding: 5px;"><i>*Tip: Bookmark this link to make it easier to access the software going forward.</i></p>
<p><b>Accessing the Baldrige Excellence Framework™</b></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The correct version of the 2017-2018 Baldrige Excellence Framework has been loaded into the Scorebook Navigator system for your reference (Business/Health Care/Education). Hover your mouse over any Criteria reference to access the appropriate Criteria requirements. You can also download a PDF of the provided Baldrige Excellence Framework booklet from the Key Factors, Item Evaluation, or Key Themes screen by clicking on the “Criteria” icon (open book).</li> </ul> <p>This copy of the Framework is intended for examiner use only. <b>By downloading the PDF, you agree not to distribute the Framework, in whole or in part, to other individuals or groups either internal or external to your organization.</b></p>
<p><b>Accessing the Application</b></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• You may access your assigned application from Scorebook Navigator after completing the conflict of interest certification for TNCPE. From your applicant’s scorebook, click on the “document” icon to download the full application.</li> </ul>
<p><b>Saving Your Work</b></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Scorebook Navigator does not have an auto-save feature. It is <b>critical</b> that you click the “save” icon following each entry you make (for example, after typing each key factor, each item strength, etc.). Scorebook Navigator will remind you to save your work every 5 minutes. This timeframe can be adjusted from the “My Accounts” screen.</li> <li>• Scorebook Navigator will timeout after a period of inactivity. Your work will not be saved if your session times out and you did not click the save button. Be sure to save your work before stepping away from your computer.</li> </ul>
<p><b>Spell Check</b></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Spell Check is available in the Scorebook Navigator system. However, the spell check will only review what is available within each open screen. You cannot use spell check to review your entire document or item.</li> </ul>
<p><b>Copy/Paste</b></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• You must use the Scorebook Navigator copy/paste icon to copy your work from Word. Using this icon strips coding embedded in the text so that it can be accessed by Scorebook Navigator. The copy/paste icon is available in most text boxes. If the copy/paste icon is not available, you will not be able to copy/paste directly from Word.</li> </ul>
<p><b>Font Size</b></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• To increase font size, use CTRL + (plus) and to shrink font size use CTRL – (minus). Using either of these will shift the layout of your view. To return to the default font size, use CTRL 0 (zero).</li> </ul>

<p><b>Step 1: Review the Baldrige Excellence Framework</b></p> <p><i>(1 hour)</i></p>	<p>Now that you are ready to begin your assignment, the first step is to review the Baldrige Excellence Framework.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Criteria for Performance Excellence</i> (pages 4-30)</li> <li>• Scoring System and Scoring Guidelines (pages 31-36)</li> <li>• Criteria Response Guidelines (pages 37-39)</li> <li>• Core Values and Concepts (pages 40-44)</li> </ul> <p><i>*Tip: For ease of reference, TNCPE recommends placing a paperclip or tab on the Glossary of Key Terms (pages 47-54).</i></p>
<p><b>Step 2: Read the Application</b></p> <p><i>(3-5 hours)</i></p>	<p><b>Read the entire application from beginning to end.</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• As you read, make note of the applicant’s key processes and any results you would expect to see related to these processes.</li> <li>• Consider highlighting key words in each paragraph, or using separate highlighters for A-D-L-I or the different categories. It’s okay to mark up and make notes on the application – find the system that works for you!</li> <li>• Also note any initial thoughts you have regarding gaps in the applicant’s responses, results you are expecting to see, or things to watch for as you begin your evaluation.</li> </ul>
<p><b>Step 3: Identify Key Factors</b></p>	<p><b>Create a master list of key factors for the applicant.</b></p> <p>A <b>key factor</b> is an attribute of an organization or its environment that influences the way the organization operates and the key challenges it faces. <b>Examiners use key factors to focus their assessments on what is most important to the applicant.</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Access the Key Factors Screen in Scorebook Navigator from your application scorebook by clicking “Key Factors” on the menu bar.</li> <li>• Then read the Criteria questions for items P.1 and P.2.</li> <li>• As you read the applicant’s Organizational Profile, which responds to these questions, identify key factors (organizational attributes that influence how the organization operates).</li> <li>• Enter these key factors into Scorebook Navigator using the following steps: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a) Use the drop-down menu labeled “Key Factor Category” to select the correct area to address (P.1a, P.1b, etc.).</li> <li>b) Then click on a numbered row to open it so you can begin typing. Enter your entire key factor, including its name, in the box provided.</li> <li>c) Click the “save” icon after each row is completed. </li> </ul> </li> </ul> <p><i>*Tip: You may add key factors to your scorebook at any time throughout your evaluation, as this is an iterative process.</i></p> <p><i>*Tip: Review sample key factors on the <a href="#">Examiner Resources</a> page of TNCPE’s website.</i></p>

**Step 4:**  
**Evaluate each**  
**item in**  
**Categories 1-7**  
**(2-3 hours per**  
**item)**

**Complete the six-step item evaluation process for each item and record your observations in the Scorebook Navigator software.**

**1. Read the Criteria item**

Read the Criteria item to refresh your memory and help you understand the item requirements. For example, when evaluating item 1.1, read Criteria item 1.1.

**2. Assign key factors to the item**

Determine the most relevant key factors for the item.

- Review the master list of key factors that you developed from the Organizational Profile.
- Considering what the Criteria is asking, which of these organizational attributes would have the greatest influence on the applicant's responses to the item requirements?
- Navigate to the Item Evaluation Screen from your menu bar, and select the appropriate item (for example, item 1.1).
- From the Key Factor References panel, select the most relevant four to six key factors for the item using the drop-down box provided. (These will be selected from the master list of key factors that you created earlier). Click the "save" icon after each. 

**3. Read the relevant section of the application**

For example, when evaluating item 1.1, read the applicant's response to item 1.1.

For **process items** (Categories 1-6), identify **processes** the applicant uses to address item requirements or any **gaps** between the Criteria and the applicant's response.

For **results items** (Category 7), group key **results** and identify any **gaps** between the Criteria and the applicant's response.

Also consider what processes and results you would expect to see based on the key factors identified in Step #2.

**4. Analyze the applicant's processes and results to identify comments.**

Evaluate the **processes** or **results** you have identified in the application using the evaluation factors – A-D-L-I or Le-T-C-I.

***\*Tip:** Review the **Process & Results Item Evaluation Factors** documents on the [Examiner Resources](#) page of TNCPE's website.*

### Processes (A-D-L-I)

Evaluate the **processes** you have identified in the application using the process evaluation factors:

- Evaluate the applicant's **Approach (A)** by considering whether the applicant's process is appropriate, effective, and systematic (well-ordered, repeatable, and uses data).
- Evaluate the extent of the applicant's **Deployment (D)** by considering whether the approach you identified is applied consistently and by the appropriate work units.
- Evaluate the applicant's cycles of **Learning (L)** by considering how the approach has been refined or improved, how it encourages innovation, and whether improvements are shared across other work units and processes.
- Evaluate the extent of the applicant's **Integration (I)** by considering whether the approach you identified is aligned with the organization's needs identified in the Org. Profile and how the process interacts with the applicant's other processes (e.g. Have the correct measures been chosen? Does this approach provide output or data that should be used by another process?).

### Results (Le-T-C-I)

Evaluate the applicant's key **results** using the results evaluation factors:

- Evaluate the applicant's **Performance Levels (Le)** by considering its current performance on a meaningful measurement scale. Performance levels permit evaluation relative to past performance, projections, goals and appropriate comparisons.
- Evaluate the applicant's performance **Trends (T)** by considering the direction and rate of change of its results. Generally, a minimum of three historical data points is needed to begin to ascertain a trend.
- Evaluate the applicant's **Comparisons (C)** by considering its performance relative to its competitors, organizations providing similar products and services, industry averages, or best-in-class organizations. The maturity of the organization should help determine which comparisons are most relevant.
- Evaluate the extent of the applicant's **Integration (I)** by considering which results measures address important customer, product/service, market, and action plan performance requirements identified in the Org. Profile and in process items; include valid indicators of future performance; and are harmonized across processes and work units to support organization-wide goals.

Based on your analysis, **identify the 6 - 10 most critical strengths and OFIs for the applicant** and outline them in Scorebook Navigator.

- For **process items** (Categories 1-6), begin by reviewing the **processes** and **gaps** you noted during Step #3. Consider whether any of the gaps you identified are important to the applicant. If so, these may be potential OFI comments.
- For **results items** (Category 7), begin by reviewing the **results** and **gaps** you noted during Step #3. Consider whether any of the gaps you identified are important to the applicant. If so, these may be potential OFI comments.

Next look at the analysis you completed above using A-D-L-I (process items) and Le-T-C-I (results items).

- For **process items**, identify areas of strength (evidence of systematic approaches, evidence of appropriate deployment, evidence of cycles of learning, evidence of integration) and areas of opportunity (lack of an approach, incomplete deployment, unclear cycles of learning, no evidence of integration).
- For **results items**, identify areas of strength (good organizational performance levels, beneficial trends, relevant comparisons, or evidence of integration) and areas of opportunity (lack of performance levels, missing or adverse trends, little to no comparative data, or no evidence of integration).

Using the applicant's key factors, determine which of these strength and OFI comments may be most critical, and enter them into Scorebook Navigator:

- On the "Item Evaluation" screen, select the correct item from the drop-down box (for example, item 1.1).
- Click on a row under the "strengths" panel to open it.
- Select the key factor or key factors most relevant to the strength comment using the provided checkboxes (you will only be able to choose from the 4-6 key factors you assigned to the item).
- Check the "Double" box to flag high-priority strengths (or OFIs) that you believe are the most critical to the applicant.
- In the "Strengths" box, write the topic sentence or main point of your strength comment.
- In the "As Evidenced By" box, list the specific evidence you observed in the application. Use figure numbers where appropriate to refer to evidence in application graphics.
- Use the provided checkboxes to indicate which evaluation factors your strength references.
- Select an "Item Reference" in the next box, such as 1.1a(1).
- Use the checkbox in the column under the "key" icon to flag potential key themes.
- Click "Save" after completing a row for each strength comment. 
- Repeat these steps to enter each of the 6-10 strength and OFI comments you have identified.

**\*Tip:** Use the "Gaps & OFIs" panel to enter your OFI comments. Use the checkboxes to indicate which evaluation factors each OFI references (for example, checking Approach and Deployment for an OFI comment indicates that approach and deployment are lacking).

## 5. Score the item

Use the Scoring Panel at the bottom of the Item Evaluation screen to determine a scoring range for each process evaluation factor:

- Review the Criteria requirements.
- Review the strength and OFI comments you drafted for the item, particularly noting any ++ or -- observations.
- Note the balance and importance of these comments relative to the item requirements and key factors.
- The Scoring Guidelines are provided in Scorebook Navigator. Follow these steps to assign an item score:
  - For **process items**, begin by reading the description of the 50-65% range in the Process Scoring Guidelines. Consider whether this range accurately describes the applicant's **Approach (A), Deployment (D), Learning (L), and Integration (I)** for the item.
  - For **results items**, begin by reading the description of the 50-65% range in the Results Scoring Guidelines. Consider whether this range accurately describes the applicant's **Levels (Le), Trends (T), Comparisons (C), and Integration (I)** for the item.
  - Move up or down the six ranges until you find the "best fit." The "best fit" range takes into account the descriptions of all the individual evaluation factors. Click on the appropriate scoring range in the row labeled "Item 1.1 Overall" at the bottom of the screen.

*The applicant does not need to demonstrate all the characteristics in the selected range; rather, the score is based on a holistic view of the four evaluation factors in aggregate.*
  - Finally, select a percentage score that is a multiple of 5 for the item in the row labeled "Item 1.1 Score."
  - Click "Save." 

## 6. Write two feedback-ready comments for the item: one strength and one OFI

In the "Feedback-Ready Comments" panel above the Scoring Grid, draft one feedback-ready strength comment and one feedback-ready OFI comment. These comments will be based on one of the strengths and OFIs you have already identified.

The purpose of a comment is to tell the applicant what it does well or what is needed to improve. Good comments convey a single thought. They provide the applicant meaningful (value-add) feedback and are easy to understand. Use this process to draft your comment:

- **Be sure your comment is grounded in the Criteria.**
- **Start with a topic sentence or main point of your comment**, which links to an evaluation factor (A-D-L-I or Le-T-C-I).
- **Give one or two supporting examples from the application.** If your OFI refers to a gap (something missing from the application), tell what is missing (e.g. "The

	<p>applicant lacks comparative data for many of its operational effectiveness measures”).</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Finish with a “so what” statement</b> to indicate why this comment is important or relevant to the applicant. The “so what” is usually based on a key factor.</li> <li>• Type your comment in the box labeled “Comment” on the “Feedback-Ready Comments” panel.</li> <li>• Indicate an item reference in the boxes to the right. Use the column to the left to indicate if your comment is a double-strength or double-OFI.</li> <li>• Click “Save.” </li> </ul> <p><i>*Tip: Review sample comments on the <a href="#">Examiner Resources</a> page of TNCP’s website.</i></p>
<p><b>Step 5:</b> <b>Check “done”!</b></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• In Scorebook Navigator, access the “Scorebooks” screen from the menu bar.</li> <li>• Locate your applicant’s scorebook under “Stage 1.”</li> <li>• Check the checkbox marked “done” to indicate that your Independent Review is complete.</li> </ul> <p><i>*Note: Your team leader will <b>NOT</b> be able to move your team to consensus review until all team members have checked “done” for the independent review stage.</i></p>