



Examiner Tip Sheet | Consensus Review

Welcome to Consensus Review!

During this phase of the evaluation process, your team will create a Consensus scorebook detailing the strengths and opportunities for improvement (OFIs) that will propel your applicant forward on its performance excellence journey. This scorebook, composed of comments and scores, will represent the collective knowledge and analytical skills of your team and will be the basis of the feedback report sent to the applicant.

Examiner Roles during Consensus Review

- **Item Lead** – synthesizes feedback from the entire examiner team and develops comments for his/her assigned items.
- **Item “Back-Up”** – provides feedback to an Item Lead on one or more items.
- As a **team member**, participate in discussions on all items to build consensus on the comments and scoring that the applicant ultimately receives.

During Consensus Review, you will use the Scorebook Navigator software to develop and refine your comments and scores.

Prior to your team’s consensus meeting, you will write comments for your assigned items; share feedback with your item “back-up;” incorporate that feedback into your Item comments; and review the comments written by all of your other team members.

Steps	Actions
Logging on to the software	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Access Scorebook Navigator at https://scorebooknav.org. <div style="border: 1px dashed black; padding: 5px; margin: 5px 0;"> <i>*Tip: Bookmark this link to make it easier to access the software going forward.</i> </div> • Scorebook Navigator Helpdesk: TNCPE office: 615-889-8323 Call or text: Sue Alexander: 615-594-7775 Tamera Fields Parsons: 423-794-7969

<p>Moving to Consensus</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> When you have completed your Independent Review, you must check “done” from the “Scorebooks” screen in Scorebook Navigator. Your team leader will not be able to move the team to consensus if you do not complete this step. <div style="border: 1px dashed black; padding: 5px; margin: 10px 0;"> <p><i>*Note: Once your team has moved to Consensus in Scorebook Navigator, the Independent Review scorebooks are locked and no additional edits can be made.</i></p> </div> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The team leader assigns each examiner responsibility to serve as the lead and “back-up” for multiple items. To view the items for which you are lead and back-up, view the “Scorebooks” screen in Scorebook Navigator and locate your assignments under “Stage 2.”
<p>Preparing an Item for Consensus Steps 1-3</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Review the Criteria requirements for your assigned item. This will help you focus on evaluating the applicant against the Criteria. <div style="border: 1px dashed black; padding: 5px; margin: 10px 0;"> <p><i>*Tip: Download the Baldrige Excellence Framework from Scorebook Navigator by clicking on the “open notebook” icon. OR hover your mouse over any Criteria reference, and that section of the Criteria will appear in a separate window.</i></p> </div> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Decide on the 4-6 key factors that you believe are most relevant to the item. In Consensus, the team leader will provide a master list of key factors to be used by the entire team. Do not worry about which key factors your teammates selected for your assigned item in Independent Review. Access your team members’ independent reviews by clicking on the gold “1” (for Stage 1 feedback). Scroll down to the “strengths” or “opportunities for improvement” panel to view your teammates’ suggested comments and feedback-ready comments. <div style="border: 1px dashed black; padding: 5px; margin: 10px 0;"> <p><i>*Tip: Click on the “print preview” icon to open your teammates’ suggested comments in a table. You may then sort the tables of suggested strengths and OFIs by item reference (recommended by TNCPE) before printing. Note that you will have to sort the strengths table and OFI table separately. TNCPE recommends disregarding the feedback-ready strengths and OFIs until you have completed the “synthesize” step below.</i></p> </div>
<p>Step 4: Synthesize</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Review your team member’s independent reviews. Where is there agreement? Where is there disagreement? Which comments will have the greatest value to the applicant? Based on the Criteria requirements and your team member’s independent reviews, determine 6-10 comment topics that you will develop into comments that deliver the greatest value to the applicant.
<p>Step 5: Write</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Write one comment for each selected topic. To write a strength comment in Scorebook Navigator, open a new row on the “Strengths” panel; to write an OFI comment, open a new row on the “Opportunities for Improvement” panel. Write your comment in the box provided. A good comment is grounded in the Criteria and includes three components: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> A topic sentence or a main point, which links to an evaluation factor (A-D-L-I or Le-T-C-I).

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ One or two supporting examples from the application. ○ Relevance to the applicant (“so what”). The “so what” for an OFI comment is often linked to one of the applicant’s key factors. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● A good comment is also insightful: it tells the applicant something it (the applicant) didn’t know. <div style="border: 1px dashed black; padding: 5px; margin-top: 10px;"> <p><i>*Tip: Review sample strength and OFI comments for process and results items on the Examiner Resources page of TNCPE’s website.</i></p> </div>
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Provide your rationale. In the “rationale” box, explain why you selected this comment: Agreement of team members? A key Criteria requirement? Important to the applicant? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Include the initials of team members that agree with the comment. ● Complete the row. For each comment (strength or OFI): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Provide a Key Factor reference (select from the provided drop-down box of the 4-6 key factors you assigned to the item), ○ Identify role model strengths or very serious OFIs by clicking in the left column (++ for double strengths or - - for double OFIs), ○ Select an item reference to indicate which part of the Criteria your comment addresses, and ○ Click under the “key” to recommend your comment topic as a potential key theme, if applicable. ● Record key comments not used. Did some team members draft strength or OFI comments (+/ -) that you are not including? Summarize these in the “Notes” box, along with your rationale for not including them in your 6-10 comments.
<p>Step 6: Score the Item</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Score the item based on the comments you have crafted (not your team members’ independent reviews). Start by reviewing your strength and OFI comments, noting their balance and importance relative to the item requirements and the applicant’s key factors. ● Next, review the range descriptions in the Scoring Guidelines (e.g. basic vs. overall vs. multiple requirements) and propose an overall scoring range and a specific score for the item on the Scoring Panel. ● Capture your scoring rationale in the Notes box under the Scoring Guidelines. <div style="border: 1px dashed black; padding: 5px; margin-top: 10px;"> <p><i>*Tip: Be prepared to explain your proposed scoring range for each element of the scoring guidelines only if asked (e.g. Where in the proposed range do you believe the Item score should fall?).</i></p> </div>

<p>Step 7: Revise</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Engage your Item “Back-Up.” Once you’ve completed steps 1-6 above, email your item back-up to request feedback.• As your back-up provides his/her feedback, their comments will be displayed in the “observations” box next to each comment.• Please respond promptly with feedback for the items YOU are backing up, too! <p><i>*Tip: To enter an Observation as an item back-up, type your feedback in the box labeled “Observation” after the applicable comment, then click “add.” Don’t forget to give feedback on the item score as well (although there is no Observation box present).</i></p>
<p>Step 8: Proposing Site Visit Issues</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• You are responsible for proposing Site Visit Issues for your assigned items. Every OFI comment and role model strength (++) should be developed into a Site Visit Issue, which you will clarify or verify with the applicant on site.• Summarize your Site Visit Issues and be prepared to explain your rationale for selecting each on your team’s consensus call.